Physics of and Achievements with the H-mode

F. Wagner Max-Planck Institut für Plasmaphysik EURATOM Association Greifswald

Goal of fusion: energy source from fusion reaction

Conditions to be met: Lawson-conditions; triple product:  $n_i T_i \tau_E > 5 \ 10^{21} \text{ m}^{-3} \text{keVs}$ 

0-dim energy balance:



Physics of and Achievements with the H-mode

F. Wagner Max-Planck Institut für Plasmaphysik EURATOM Association Greifswald

Goal of fusion: energy source from fusion reaction

Conditions to be met: Lawson-conditions; triple product:  $n_i T_i \tau_E > 5 \ 10^{21} \text{ m}^{-3} \text{keVs}$ 

0-dim energy balance:





# ) Confinement and transport



Thermal plasma energy content: 
$$W = 2 \times \frac{3}{2} \int nT d^3r \approx 3V \bar{n}\bar{T}$$

Power flux across edge  $P = 2 \times Sn\chi \nabla T|_{edge} \approx 2Sn\overline{\chi}\frac{T}{a}$  in steady-state:

**Confinement and diffusivity:** 

$$\tau_E \approx \frac{3a^2}{4\overline{\chi}}$$

Importance of  $\tau_{E}$ :

Triple product:

**Fusion power:** 

$$nT\tau_{E} \sim \tau_{E}^{2}$$
$$P_{fus} \sim \beta^{2}B^{4} \sim \tau_{F}$$



#### Transport in toroidal systems



Random walk conception: D ~  $\Delta x^2/\Delta t$ 

```
Parallel to magnetic field: \Delta x \sim \lambda; \Delta t \sim \tau_{coulomb}
```

Perpendicular to magnetic field:  $\Delta x \sim \rho_L$ ;  $\Delta t \sim \tau_{coulomb}$ 

In toroidal geometry:  $\Delta x \sim banana \text{ width}; \Delta t \sim \tau_{trapped-free};$ fraction of trapped particles enters

In helical systems (3D): helical ripple enters; collisionless losses



=> Stellarator optimisation by quasi-symmetry

<ñ v>

2

6

0

**r** - **r**<sub>0</sub>

## **Turbulent transport**

microinstabilities drive turbulent eddies:

radial extent (radial correlation lenght  $\rho_c)$  ~ 1 - 2 cm

typical lifetime of turbulent eddies (correlation time  $\tau_c$ ): 0.5 - 1 ms



# Scaling Laws

• Regression analysis with the ansatz

 $\tau_E = 10^{\alpha_x} a^{\alpha_a} R^{\alpha_R} P^{\alpha_P} \bar{n}_e^{\alpha_n} B^{\alpha_B} \iota_{2/3}^{\alpha_l}$ 

**Tokamak scaling** L-mode scaling (1989) H-mode scaling (H(y,2))

**Stellarator scaling** ISS95, ISS04

- ISS95 for stellarators (and tokamaks)
  - minor radius  $\alpha_a = +2.21$
  - major radius  $\alpha_R = +0.65$
  - heating power  $\alpha_{P} = -0.59$
  - density  $\alpha_n = +0.51$
  - magnetic field  $\alpha_{\rm B} = +0.8$
  - lota





Similar confinement times in tokamaks and stellarators 7



# Importance of improved confinement

IPP

 $Q = P_{fus}/P_{ext}$ 



#### Characteristics of the H-mode transition



The main features of the H-mode

the marker for the transition is the drop in the  $H_{\alpha}$ -radiation a spontaneous and distinct transition out of state in transport equilibrium both energy- and particle confinement time increase simultaneously new instabilities appear in the H-phase: ELMs, edge-localised modes pp

IPP



#### The plasma edge becomes quiescent and sharp

NSTX







## Different edge activities in L- and H-modes

#### Turbulent edge filaments in L-mode and in H-mode between ELMs





# 2 Initial observations



- (1) L- and H-modes differ in energy confinement time by about a factor of two: two operational branches exist; the space in between in not accessible. energy, particle, impurity, and momentum confinement improve simultaneously
- (2) The H-mode transition has a power threshold P<sub>th</sub>: Obviously, a critical condition has to be met via heating.
- (3) There is a dwell time after the heating power has been increased A formation process has been initiated by stepping up the heating power with a time scale depending also on external settings (power, configuration (SN<sup>+</sup>, DN, SN<sup>-</sup>)).
- (4) When the heating power has been switched off, the plasma remains in the H-phase again for a dwell time in the order of the confinement time: The plasma does not hover at the transition condition but goes deeper into the H-mode domain. The dwell-time points to the existence of an hysteresis. The back-transition is of specific interest because the plasma is not driven but evolves in equilibria according to its internal time scales. Also the back transition occurs in a distinct step – the gap between H- and L-mode branches.
- (5) There is also a low density threshold:

the critical transition condition cannot be met (local circumstances: radiation, locked modes).

## Initial observations



#### (6) Large sawteeth can trigger the H-mode:

The critical parameter seems to be a local condition at the plasma edge, which can be met by a thermal wave



(7) ELMs appeared in the H-mode as a new type of edge instability. <sup>13</sup>



## Overview over transition characteristics



#### Major results from W7-AS

Implication of the stellarator H-mode:

- -H-mode is a ubiquitous characteristics of toroidal confinement
- iota at the separatrix is finite: the magnetic shear anomaly of the divertor configuration is not essential
- -the ambipolarity is determined by  $\Gamma_{e} = \Gamma_{i}$  (enforced ambipolarity)
- -toroidal rotation is highly damped
- -P<sub>th</sub> like  $\tau_E$  do not show an isotopic effect

Relevant differences to tokamaks

- $-P_{th}^{stell} < P_{th}^{tok}$  (by ~ factor 2)
- -H-mode in selected iota-windows only



## Dependencies of the power threshold

#### $\mathbf{P}_{th}$ is lower

- (1) with separatrix instead of limiter operation
- (2) in deuterium instead of hydrogen plasmas
- (3) in clean instead of dirty plasmas
- (4) with gas fuelling from the divertor or the high-field side instead of the low-field side
- (5) in single null plasmas with the ion-grad B-drift to the X-point (SN<sup>+</sup>) instead of away from it (SN<sup>-</sup>);
  in double null plasmas (DN), P<sub>th</sub> is in between:

Obviously, a supporting / prohibiting aspect nullifies in the symmetric case.

pρ



#### Specific observations



Two variants of the H-mode: with and without ELMs with ELMs: moderate increase in confinement time suitable for steady-state operation without ELMs: transiently better confinement; impurity accumulation



#### Change in the prominent mode activity



Relaxations in the plasma core during ohmic heating: Sawteeth

Relaxations at the plasma edge in the H-phase: ELMs

IPP



#### Initial and final dwell times



### Short H-phases in the PBP T<sub>e</sub>-rise



Importance of T<sub>e</sub>; theory now:  $T_e/\sqrt{L_n}$ 



## Configuration and ion $\nabla B\text{-drift}$

The power threshold is low when the ion grad-B-drift is toward the X-point



Therefore, the barrier is locked to the edge

IPP

#### Stellarator H-mode with ELMs





#### Magnetic characteristics of helical systems





IPP

## H-mode in helical devices



# Agreement with tokamak H-mode characteristics

The H-mode develops most easily (lowest power) with separatrix edge

- Elmy and quiescent H-modes are possible
- The symmetric development is observed: L H L
- $P_{thr}$  scales with B and  $n_{e}\left(CHS\right)$
- Edge gradients increase at the transition
- The electric field well deepens at the transition
- The edge fluctuation level strongly decreases at the transition

The pivot point of ELMs is 1-3 cm inside separatrix ELMs last for about 200  $\mu$ s  $\Delta$ W/W ~  $\Delta$ N/N  $\leq$  5%

Impurity accumulation in H\* inspite of broad  $n_H$ -profiles



W7-AS

24

## Disagreement, differences

The transition into the quiescent H-mode occurs at a critical (power dependent) density

Operationally, the H-mode is achieved by increasing the density after having increased the heating power (gradual change of control parameter).

H\* develops in small iota windows around  $\iota \sim 0.5$  (island separatrix)

The transition into the H-mode shows a preceding phase where E<sub>r</sub> already deepens and the turbulence level generally decreases

The calculated edge bootstrap current is small (ELMs!)









# (4) Initial understanding



#### The H-mode as bifurcation



Density feedback controlled:

H-mode: density rises though external gas flux to zero

L-mode: density decreases though external gas flux increases

Two confinement branches; space in between not accessible.

# Hysteresis, limit-cycle oscillations

Hysteresis: after H-transition, power can be reduced by factor of 2 dwell-time at back-transition:  $\Delta t_{H-L} / \tau_E \sim 0.57$  same for ASDEX, W7-AS (ASDEX:  $\tau_E = 67$  ms;  $\Delta t_{H-L} = 38$  ms. W7-AS:  $\tau_E = 28$  ms;  $\Delta t_{H-L} = 16$  ms).



## Development of an edge transport barrier

IPP

#### SX development with sawteeth after NBI switch-on





#### Development of the edge transport barrier



E. Manso, et al.

IPP



Reduction of the edge turbulence level

#### Measurement with CO2-laser scattering at plasma edge



The development of the transport barrier is caused by the reduction of edge turbulence

pp

# Reduction of the edge transport





The confinement improvement is caused by a reduction of turbulent fluxes



## Summary on initial observations

**The H-mode** transition results from a balance of supportive and destructive contributions;

The power balance plays a role.

#### **Evidence for source term:**

power threshold dwell time prior to the transition which shrinks with increasing heating power dwell time after the beam pulse triggering of H-mode by sawtooth heat pulse PBP H-mode

#### **Evidence for sink term:**

impurity radiation limiter versus divertor operation inboard/divertor fuelling versus outboard fuelling

#### **Evidence for role of transport coefficient:**

 $P_{th}$  is lower for D than H; the same is correct for transport and  $\tau_E$ . In stellarators, there is no isotope effect, neither in  $P_{th}$  nor in confinement ! Obviously, the isotopic effect is introduced via  $\chi_e = f(A_i) => P_{th}(A_i)$ 

#### Other process to be discussed now



Generic feature of the H-mode: development of an E<sub>r</sub>-well inside separatrix

Radial extent of well independent of machine size In stellarators:  $E_r$ -well in the L-phase already quite deep =>  $P_{th}^{STELL} < P_{th}^{TOK}$ 

IPP

## Changes in edge flow direction







### Causality between E<sub>r</sub> and transport



Use of biasing probe makes E<sub>r</sub> to a control parameter <sup>3</sup>

pp



## Induced H-phases





Within the  $E_r$ -well, the turbulent transport is quenched The  $E_r$ -field (gradient) is the cause of the edge transport barrier

Is there a more continuous relation between  $\Gamma_{turbulent}$  and  $E_r$ ?



## Shear flow decorrelation of turbulence

#### H. Biglari, P. H. Diamond, P. Terry





Turbulence becomes more isotropic

Radial size scales reduced



Experimental confirmation of shear flow decorrelation



IPP



## Modelling of shear-flow decorrelation

#### Gyrokinetic particle simulation of plasma microturbulence



#### Z. Lin at al., Science





# 6) The Origin of $E_r$ at the edge

#### 2D:

Fluxes are intrinsically ambi-polar and transport coefficients do not explicitely depend on  $E_r$ 

 $\langle j_r \rangle = 0$ , independed of  $E_r$ 

#### 3D:

 $<j_r> = 0$ , ensured by  $\Gamma_e = \Gamma_i$ : enforced ambi-polarity

$$\Gamma = -D_{1}(E_{r})n\left\{\frac{1}{n}\frac{\partial n}{\partial r} - q\left(\frac{E_{r}}{T}\right) + \frac{D_{12}}{D_{11}}\frac{1}{T}\frac{\partial T}{\partial r}\right\}$$

$$E_r = \nabla p_i / en + (D_{12} / D_{11} - 1) \nabla T_i$$

Stellarator ambi-polarity is characterized by bifurcations: electron/ion roots  $E_r$  changes with the gradients (O( $\tau_E$ ))



## The composition of E<sub>r</sub>







In a fully developed H-mode:  $E_r(a-\delta)$  given by  $\nabla p_i$  $\nabla p_i$  plays an important role: it stabilises the developed H-mode co-NBI: unfavourable conditions

# Causality between $E_r$ and $\nabla p_i$



TEXTOR: H-mode induced by polarisation probe

E<sub>r</sub> is oscillating

n<sub>e</sub> (gradp<sub>i</sub>) also oscillates



Analysis done by K.H. Burrell, Phys. Plasmas

Causality:  $\nabla E_r$  leads  $n_e$  by about 5 ms

## Temporal characteristics of $L \Rightarrow H$



R. Groebner, K. Burrell, R. Moyer, DIIID-team

There is a pre-phase

Jump of  $E_r$  at the L=>H transition ( $\tau < <\tau_E$ )

T<sub>i</sub> changes slowly

The turbulence level drops joinly with E<sub>r</sub>

#### JFT-2M: transition within 12 $\mu$ s

R.A. Moyer et al., Phys.Plasmas, 2, 2397, 1995



Temporal characteristics of the back transition  $H \Rightarrow L$ 

Ibb



μþ



### Jump in E<sub>r</sub> at the back transition





#### There a continuous relation between $v_{\perp}$ and $\tilde{n}$



L-mode equilibrium  $\Leftrightarrow$  L-mode transport at H-mode profiles



## Role of the v×B-term



## Radial force balance: $E_r = \nabla p_i / en_e - v_\theta B_\phi + v_\phi B_\theta$

 $v_{\phi}B_{\theta}$  introduces the toroidal momentum balance

co-NBI obstructs the transition (DIIID: P<sub>th</sub> lower with ctr-NBI)

~ 0 in helical systems (edge ripple)

# Role of the v×B-term





Several concepts and models developed

#### Ion loss model

would explain short time scales! but: L-H transitions in large range of  $\nu^{\star}$ 

#### Physics of poloidal viscosity

W7-AS: strong relation between edge field structures and H-mode window W7-AS:  $M_{\theta} \sim 2-3$  Tohoku heliac:  $\mu$  beyond tor. resonance





Edge rotational transform



pp

# Flow drive originating from SOL flows

Addressing the effect of the configuration onto  $P_{th}$  (ion-grad B drift,  $B \times \nabla B$ ) The turbulent flow from the plasma into the SOL at the low-field side SOL-flows from transport, PS-flows,  $E_r \times B$  -flows (E-field positive in SOL) SOL-flow dissipates across separatrix (C-Mod)





# Short detour to the planets



Formation of large-scale flows (zonal flows) from turbulence via RS. ZFs are sheared flows perpendicular to the turbulence driving gradients. Observd in laboratory experiments,

the sonic wind in gases, meandering flows in oceans, Jet streams, in the ionosphere e.g. Rossby waves (Coriolis force instead of Lorentz force) in the sun

## Reynolds stress and Zonal flows

Poloidal force balance:  $0 = j_r B/n_i - m_i \mu_{\theta} v_{\theta i} + m_i \frac{\vartheta}{\vartheta r} (\langle \tilde{v}_{ri} \tilde{v}_{\theta i} \rangle)$ 



ZF demonstrated

C. Holland et al., Phys. Rev. Letters R. A. Moyer et al., Phys. Rev. Letters A. Fujisawa et al., Phys. Rev. Letters

IPP



#### The role of Zonal flows in L-H Transitions



H. Xia et al., Phys. Rev. Letters Conjecture: E<sub>r</sub>-field caused by zonal flows



M. G. Shats et al., Phys. Rev. Letters M. G. Shats et al., Phys. Review E one at injection k, k<sub>i</sub>,
 the other in the k-range of large poloidal structures.



## Summary of the H-1 results

- Drift-wave turbulence injected at  $k_i = 200 \text{ m}^{-1}$  (p'; linear instability range)
- Energy cascades to smaller and larger k via 3-wave coupling
- The plasma boundary limits the largest possible scale
- Spectral energy is transferred into coherent modes: time varying zonal flows
- Spectral energy accumulates at  $k=k_{\rm c}\rightarrow 0;$  turbulence "condenses"
- In the experiment, large m=0 (+side band) structures appear: mean ZF, E<sub>r</sub>-shear
- Simultaneously, the broad-band turbulence disappears: H-transition
- The kinetic energy of the resulting flow agrees with the pot. energy of the turbulence field within 20%
- The injection DW at  $k_i$  remains, even intensifies (p  $\hat{})$
- Spectral energy transfer between  $k_{\rm i}$  and  $k_{\rm c}$  maintains flow
- This non-local transfer process (between well separated spectral ranges) prevents turbulence: confinement increases 54



## **Related Observations on W7-AS**



PP



## Achievements in the H-mode

The 16.1 MW DT discharge of JET



IPP

# High-performance discharges: Tokamak



IPP

## Long-pulse HDH discharge of W7-AS



![](_page_58_Figure_0.jpeg)

#### H-mode as confinement basis for ITER

![](_page_58_Figure_2.jpeg)

Cost scaling: \$ ~ H<sup>-1.3</sup> \* H-mode ITER: 5 Bill € Equivalent L-mode ITER: 12.3 Bill € \* S-I Itoh, K Itoh, and Fukuyama, Fusion Engineering and Design pp

![](_page_59_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_59_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### Edge localised modes repetitive destruction of edge transport barrier

![](_page_59_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_59_Picture_5.jpeg)

ELM

#### **Between ELMs**

N. Ben Ayed, MAST

PГ

![](_page_60_Picture_1.jpeg)

#### ELMs

Edge localised modes

repetitive destruction of edge transport barrier MHD event or limit-cycle? Often there is an MHD precursor ELMs can be singular and large or they can be frequent and erratic

Different types of ELM are discriminated Typ-I ELMs: large, more ideal MHD instabilities Typ-III ELMs: small, frequent, more resistive MHD

> driven by edge pressure gradient and/or edge bootstrap current BUT: Bootstrap current in stellarator edge is low

![](_page_60_Figure_7.jpeg)

Edge pedestal DIIID (R. Stambaugh)

![](_page_61_Picture_1.jpeg)

## ELMs and plasma-wall interaction

![](_page_61_Figure_3.jpeg)

JET :  $\Delta W_{ELM} \sim 1 \text{ MJ} \text{ and } \tau_{ELM} \sim 100 \ \mu s \rightarrow P_{ELM}^{PFCs} \sim 10 \text{ GW} (P_{steady-state} = 10 \text{ MW})$ ITER :  $\Delta W_{ELM} \sim 20 \text{ MJ}$ ;  $f_{ELM} \sim \text{Hz}$  $E_{div} > 2.5 \text{ MJm}^{-2} \& q_{div} > 5 - 10 \text{ GWm}^{-2} \text{ in} \sim 250-500 \ \mu s \rightarrow \Delta_{ELM} > 10 \ \mu m$ 

IPP

![](_page_62_Picture_1.jpeg)

ELM mitigation by partial edge ergodisation

#### DIIID: use of perturbation coils

![](_page_62_Figure_4.jpeg)

Alternative: slow pellet injection

![](_page_63_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_63_Picture_2.jpeg)

The plasma self-organises in the H-mode such that the turbulence is lower at larger driving forces and that the ignition conditions are approached

The H-mode has inspired theory to develop a better understanding of turbulent transport

The situation is involved however:

There are many practical knobs to realise and develop the H-mode An understanding might have to involve the

power balance

the toroidal momentum balance

the poloidal momentum balance

The transformation of turbulent energy into flow

the SOL flow and viscous momentum transfer

The many practical knobs may indicate that several mechanisms are involved

The H-mode is a contribution to the physics of highly non-linear hydrodynamic systems

![](_page_64_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_64_Picture_3.jpeg)

There is no complete understanding of the H-transition

ion-loss concept high poloidal mach numbers the role of parallel viscosity and the damping of zonal flows the interface with the SOL the actual trigger condition to the H-mode the self-consistent  $E_r$ -field development and turbulence quench the  $P_{th}$ -scaling the ion-grad B effect modelling of a complete cycle: L=>H and back H=>L

More has to be understood about ELMs and ELM-mitigation